

1  
2  
3  
4 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
5 WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON  
6 AT SEATTLE

7 IN RE: PHENYLPROPANOLAMINE  
8 (PPA) PRODUCTS LIABILITY  
9 LITIGATION,  
10  
11

MDL NO. 1407

SUGGESTION OF REMAND  
ORDER

12 This document relates to the  
13 actions listed on Attachment A  
14

15 The court, having reviewed the records of the cases listed  
16 on Attachment A, and having heard argument of counsel, finds and  
17 rules as follows:

18 (1) Common discovery and other coordinated pretrial proceed-  
19 ings have been completed. Any remaining issues are case-specific,  
20 and best determined by the transferor courts.

21 (2) These cases will not benefit from further coordinated  
22 proceedings as part of MDL 1407, and are ready to be remanded to  
23 their respective transferor courts.

24 For these reasons, pursuant to Rule 7.6 of the Rules of  
25 Procedure of the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation, the  
26 court issues its Suggestion of Remand Order in the cases listed  
on Attachment A. The Clerk is ORDERED to provide copies of this  
Order to the Clerk of the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litiga-  
tion and to the clerks of the transferor district courts listed

ORDER

Page - 1 -

1 on Appendix A.

2  
3 DATED at Seattle, Washington this 1<sup>ST</sup> day of September,  
4 2004.

5 s/ Barbara Jacobs Rothstein  
6 BARBARA JACOBS ROTHSTEIN  
7 UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26

**APPENDIX A**

WD WA Cause #	Case	Transferor Court/ Cause #
01cv2169	Ronald E. Allegreto v. Glaxosmithkline, et al.	Western Dist. of Louisiana (Shreve- port) No. 01cv2224
01cv2106	Allen Alexander v. Bayer Corporation	Middle Dist. of Louisiana (Baton Rouge), No. 01cv860
02cv1529	Jane Anderson, et al. v. Perrigo Co., Inc.	Middle Dist. of North Carolina No. 02-345
02cv899	Marsha Archer, et al. v. Whitehall-Robbins Health- care Corp., et al.	Central District of California, Southern Division, No. 01cv1050
01cv2091	Rona J. Averill v. Schering-Plough Healthcare Products, Inc.	Southern District of Mississippi (West- ern) No. 01cv309
02cv22	Karen Baranowski, et al. v. American Home Products Corporation	Northern District of Indiana (Hammond) No. 01cv599
03cv2103	Edna Barnett v. Bayer Corporation, et al.	Southern District of Mississippi (East- ern) No. 01cv169 originally a multi- plaintiff case
02cv34	Kathy Bartram v. Bayer Corp., et al.	Western District of Louisiana (Lafay- ette) No. 01cv2439
02cv895	Cleotha Beasley v. Ameri- can Home Products Corp., et al.	Northern District of Alabama (Southern) No. 02cv408
02cv418	Kenneth Bevis v. Glaxo- smithkline Corp., et al	Northern District of Alabama (Northwest- ern) No. 01cv1294
02cv1010	Jasmine Bias, et al. v. Bayer Corporation, et al.	Central District of California (Western Division) 01cv10869

ORDER

Page - 3 -

02cv553	Terry L. Boak v. Bayer Corporation	Western District of Wisconsin No. 02cv66C
02cv1511	Margaret Burns v. Wyeth, Inc.	Northern District of Alabama (Northeastern) No. 01cv1287
02cv22	William J. Burns, Jr. v. Wyeth, et al.	Northern District of Indiana (Hammond) No. 01cv599
02cv526	Alvin Carter v. Bayer Corporation, et al.	Eastern District of California (Fresno) No. 02cv5031
02cv897	Richard Casanova v. Vons Companies, Inc.	Central District of California (Western Division) No. 01cv9404
01cv2157	Kathleen Clark, et al. v. Bayer Corporation	Middle District of Louisiana (Baton Rouge) No. 01cv941
02cv545	Richard Coleman v. Bayer Corporation	Middle District of Louisiana (Baton Rouge) No. 02cv19
01cv2158	Gloria Coleman, et al. v. Bayer Corporation	Middle District of Louisiana (Baton Rouge) No. 01cv942
01cv1881	Janet Cotter v. Novartis Consumer Health	Eastern District of Tennessee (Chattanooga) No. 01cv7
01cv1754	Joseph Darville v. Novartis Pharmaceuticals	Middle District of Louisiana (Baton Rouge) No. 01cv512
01cv2132	Tyrone Denson v. Bayer Corporation	Central District of California (Western Division) No. 01-9391
02cv1535	Matthew J. Diamond v. Bayer Corporation	Southern District of Ohio (Columbus) No. 02cv469
02cv550	Shannon Dudley v. Novartis Consumer Health, Inc., et al.	Western District of Louisiana (Shreveport) No. 01cv2507

ORDER

Page - 4 -

01cv1758	Donald Dunar v. Novartis Consumer Health, Inc., et al.	Eastern District of Pennsylvania (Philadelphia) No. 01cv1567
02cv771	Sandra Espinoza v. Whitehall-Robbins, et al.	Eastern District of California (Sacramento) No. 01cv2045
02cv905	Shirley Figg v. American Home Products Corp., et al.	Western District of Kentucky (Louisville) No. 01cv707
02cv30	Arlene Finnester v. Whitehall-Robbins Healthcare, et al.	Western District of Louisiana (Alexandria) No. 01cv2073
02cv1521	Jimmy R. Fleniken, et al. v. Bayer Corporation	Western District of Louisiana (Lake Charles) No.02cv816
02cv348	Roy Forest v. Bayer Corporation	Eastern District of Louisiana No. 01cv3846
01cv1875	Aaron Fryer v. Novartis Consumer Health	Eastern District of North Carolina (Wilmington) No. 01cv110
02cv765	Donna Garcia v. Bayer Corporation, et al.	Central District of California (Western Division) No. 02cv995
01cv2016	R.L. George v. American Home Products Corporation	Western District of Louisiana (Shreveport) No. 01cv1922
03cv1391	Kathleen Glorioso v. Bayer Corporation	Northern District of California (San Francisco) No. 01cv4181 originally a multiple plaintiff case, <i>Sandra Mustoe, et al v. Bayer Corporation</i>

01cv1649	Vera Gions v. Bayer Corporation, et al.	Western District of Louisiana (Shreveport) No. 01cv1598
01cv1796	Bobby Gray v. Glaxosmith-kline	Western District of Louisiana (Monroe) No. 01cv1761
01cv1653	Maria Graziose, et al. v. American Home Products Corporation, et al.	District of Nevada No. 01cv581RLH-RJJ
02cv1268	Linda Grover v. SmithKline Beecham Consumer Healthcare, et al.	Western District of Wisconsin No. 02cv78C
01cv2183	Katherine Grunweil v. Bayer Corporation	Southern District of Ohio (Dayton) No. 01cv452
02cv1265	Juan Guitierrez v. Bayer Corporation	Southern District of New York (Foley Square) No. 02cv884
01cv2131	Delores Hall v. Thompson Medical Co., et al.	Central District of California (Western Division) No. 01cv9389
02cv1510	Rushie Hall v. Bayer Corporation	Northern District of Alabama (Southern) No. 02cv1204
02cv1512	Berneata T. Harris v. Bayer Corporation	Southern District of Alabama (Selma) No. 02cv317
01cv2159	Grover C. Harrison v. Bayer Corporation	Middle District of Louisiana (Baton Rouge) No. 01cv943
01cv2165	Albert Henderson, et al. v. Bayer Corporation	Western District of Louisiana (Monroe) No. 01-2395
02cv1862	Michael Hoover, et al. v. SmithKline Beecham Corp., et al.	District of Minnesota No. 02cv1120
01cv1403	Kelley Howard v. Schering-Plough Corporation	Northern District of Texas (Abilene) No. 01cv47

02cv1547	Paul Huffer v. Novartis Pharmaceutical, et al.	Western District of Kentucky (Louisville) No. 01cv753
03cv1375	Pamela Huggins v. Bayer Corporation	Eastern District of Kentucky (Lexington) No. 01cv456 originally a multi- ple plaintiff case, <i>Pamela Huggins, et al. v. Bayer Corp.</i>
02cv792	Mary Louise Hunnicutt v. Novartis Corporation	Western District of Louisiana (Monroe) No. 02cv184
02cv1174	Zula Hunter v. Bayer Corporation, et al.	Western District of Louisiana (Shreve- port) No. 02cv522
01cv2095	Gloria Jenkins v. Bayer Corporation	Western District of Louisiana (Alexan- dria) No. 01cv2090
02cv902	Susan Jennings, et al. v. Whitehall-Robbins Healthcare Corp., et al.	Northern District of California (San Jose) No. 01cv21024
02cv2602	Kathy Johnson, et al. v. Bayer Corporation	District of Minne- sota No. 02cv3813
03cv2119 (consolidated into 03cv1384)	Mildred Jones v. American Home Products Corp., et al.	Western District of Tennessee (Memphis) No. 01cv2921
02cv371	Paul Kelley, et al. v. Bayer Corporation, et al.	Eastern District of Texas (Beaumont) No. 01cv872
02cv766	Jason Kesterson, et al. v. Bayer Corporation	Central District of California (Western Division No. 02-997
02cv1261	Linda King-Corbin, et al. v. SmithKline Beecham Corp.	District of Connect- icut (New Haven) No. 02cv628

02cv38	Kathlyn Kopecky v. American Home Products Corp.	Northern District of Ohio (Cleveland) No. 01-2526
02cv764	Theresa LaTour, et al. v. Bayer Corp., et al.	Central District of California (Western Division) No. 02cv992
01cv2104	Kathy Lowery v. Bayer Corporation, et al.	Middle District of Louisiana (Baton Rouge) No. 01cv844
02cv361	Inez Lyons v. Bayer Consumer Care	Southern District of Mississippi (Jackson) No. 01cv964
02cv275	Albert H. Macon v. Bayer Corporation	Western District of Louisiana (Shreveport) No. 01cv2437
01cv2111	Joseph McGee, et al. v. Bayer Corporation, et al.	Middle District of Louisiana (Baton Rouge) No. 01cv872
01cv2096	Cecil McKey v. Bayer Corporation	Western District of Louisiana (Alexandria) No. 01cv2091
01cv2093	Patricia Ann Medina, et al. v. Bayer Corp., et al.	District of Minnesota No. 01cv1868
02cv759	Leslie Mergen v. Whitehall Robbins, et al.	Central District of California (Western Division) No. 02cv829
02cv2023	Wanda Meyer v. Novartis Consumer Health, Inc., et al.	Norther District of Oklahoma (Tulsa) No. 02cv502
01cv1693	Ethel Middleton, et al. v. Bayer Corporation	Northern District of Alabama (Southern) No. 01cv2101
01cv2173	Byron D. Minor v. Bayer Corporation, et al.	Western District of Louisiana (Lafayette) No. 01cv2282



01cv2103	Debbi Mitchell v. Bayer Corporation, et al.	Western District of Louisiana (Lafayette) No. 01cv2141
02cv1548	Donald Morris v. GlaxosmithKline, PLC, et al.	Western District of Kentucky (Louisville) No. 02cv651
02cv554	Donald Moulds v. Bayer Consumer Care	Southern District of Mississippi (Eastern) No. 01cv374
02cv2026	Tracey Noble v. Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corp., et al.	Northern District of Texas (Lubbock) No. 02cv150
01cv1757	Russell Outz v. Novartis Consumer Health, Inc.	District of Nebraska (Lincoln) No. 01cv3090
01cv2174	Emile Pitre v. Bayer Corporation	Western District of Louisiana (Lafayette) No. 01cv2284
01cv2146	Pamela Pollard v. Bayer Corporation	Eastern District of Louisiana (New Orleans) No. 01cv3420
02cv1544	Richard L. Powers v. Whitehall-Robbins, et al.	Eastern District of Wisconsin (Milwaukee) No. 02cv227
02cv1520	Clemontine Rivers v. Bayer Corporation	Western District of Louisiana (Alexandria) No. 02cv479
02cv372	Lonnie Roberts v. SmithKline Beecham Corp.	Northern District of Texas (Dallas) No. 01cv2648
02cv262	James Roundtree v. Bayer Corporation	Eastern District of Louisiana (New Orleans) No. 01cv3549

01cv2048	Pinkie Ruffin v. Bayer Corporation, et al.	Western District of Louisiana (Shreveport) No. 01cv1744
02cv1524	Gladys Russ v. Bayer Corporation	Western District of Louisiana (Shreveport) No. 02cv470
02cv1177	Sheri Scherf v. American Home Products Corporation, et al.	Western District of Oklahoma (Oklahoma City) No. 02cv284
02cv338	Earl Sherwood v. American Home Products Corporation	Eastern District of California (Fresno) No. 01cv3689
02cv1262	Sylvia Smith v. Novartis AG, et al.	Northern District of Georgia (Atlanta) No. 02cv833
01cv2156	Vivian Spears, et al. v. Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corp., et al.	Middle District of Louisiana (Baton Rouge) No. 01-934
02cv791	Linda Spillers v. American Home Products Corp.	Western District of Louisiana (Monroe) No. 01cv2095
01cv2097	Preston Stemman v. Bayer Corp.	Western District of Louisiana (Lake Charles) No. 01cv2093
02cv37	Barbara Stevens v. American Home Products Corp.	Southern District of New York No. 01cv8840
01cv1647	Ruth Stevenson, et al. v. Novartis Consumer Health, et al.	Middle District of Louisiana (Baton Rouge) No. 01cv678
02cv339	Robert Stotler, et al. V. Bayer Corp., et al.	Eastern District of California (Fresno) No. 02cv6390
01cv1655	Kimberly Strazis v. Bayer Corp., et al.	District of South Carolina (Spartanburg) No. 01cv2143

01cv1883	Karen Tanner v. Novartis Consumer Health, Inc., et al.	Southern District of Texas (Galveston) No. 01cv519
02cv35	Tammy Taylor v. Bristol-Myers Squibb Co.	District of Minnesota No. 01cv2122
01cv2060	Dianne Thomas v. Bayer Corp., et al.	Western District of Louisiana (Shreveport) No. 01cv1489
02cv1868	Clifton Tobias v. Novartis AG, et al.	Eastern District of Texas (Tyler) No. 02cv263
01cv1756	Linda Vizena, et al. v. Novartis Corp., et al.	Western District of Louisiana (Lafayette) No. 01cv858
01cv1704	Vicki D. Vogt v. American Home Products Corp., et al.	Eastern District of Pennsylvania (Philadelphia) No. 01cv2483
02cv40	Kevin Walker v. American Home Products Corp., et al.	Eastern District of Tennessee (Chattanooga) No. 01cv329
01cv1642	Ramona Wallace v. Whitehall-Robbins Healthcare, et al.	Central District of California (Western Division) No. 01cv6835
01cv1706	Trecina Washington v. American Home Products, et al.	Eastern District of Texas (Lufkin) No. 01cv157
02cv419	Andrew Wiggins, et al. v. American Home Products, et al.	Northern District of Alabama (Northwestern) No. 01cv2303
02cv36	James H. Williams v. Novartis Consumer Health, Inc.	Southern District of Mississippi (Eastern) No. 01cv353
01cv2107	Lucille Wolfe v. Bayer Corp., et al.	Middle District of Louisiana (Baton Rouge) No. 01-861

02cv2616	Patricia Wood v. Whitehall-Robbins	Southern District of New York (White Plains) No. 02cv7979
01cv1407	Carolyn Yoakum v. Novartis Corp.	Western District of Louisiana (Shreve- port) No. 01cv522
01cv2099	Sandra Young v. Bayer Corp.	Western District of Louisiana (Monroe) No. 01cv2097